Literature Review: Comparative Analysis of Multicultural Education in America and Indonesia

Rahyudi Dwiputra

rahyudidwiputra@upi.edu

Departemen Civic Education, Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia

Dadang Sundawa

dadangsundawa@upi.edu

Departemen Civic Education, Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia

Abstract: The purpose of this study is to compare the history and policies of multicultural education in America and Indonesia. Writing this literature review article uses library research methods sourced from database searches such as Google Scholar, ScienceDirect, Taylor & Francis Online and other academic online media. The results of the study show that from a historical point of view, Multicultural Education in America emerged in the 1960s because of the reform movement that discussed the issue of discrimination between whites and dark-skinned groups (black), while in Indonesia it was marked after the collapse of the New Order period in 1998 which opened democratic shell about the idea of pluralism and multiculturalism due to the politics of uniformity and monoculturalism. Meanwhile, in terms of Multicultural Education policy, in America it is part of social assimilation for immigrants, while in Indonesia it is the development of local cultural contexts in each respective region.

Keywords: Comparison, Multicultural Education, America & Indonesia

Introduction

Education is very important to make humans as complete human beings in all aspects of life. According to Ki Hajar Dewantara that the purpose of implementing the educational process is to "determine all the natures that exist in these children, so that they as humans and members of society achieve the highest benefit and happiness" (Dewantara, 1961, p. 20). More than that, it is a process to "humanize humans" where humans are expected to be able to understand themselves, other people, nature and including their cultural environment (Driyarkara, 1980, p. 8). So that the achievement of educational goals is a challenge for all time to provide the best educational services to people who have cultural differences.

Through the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) in October 1994 in Geneva, education was recommended to accept the values of diversity, strengthen national identity and encourage the convergence of ideas, and be able to resolve conflicts peacefully (Palili, S. 2018). It is recommended that educational needs must be able to accommodate and provide learning to create a new culture and be tolerant of other cultures, in other words, education has a multicultural basis. Bhikhu Parekh (2008) says that the recognition of multiculturalism of cultural differences can cause a person to be unable to do something without being supported by differences in rights. With the existence of multicultural education, it is expected to be one of the solutions in developing human resources who have a strong character and are tolerant of other cultures.

However, multicultural education is still interpreted by various views. According to Rosyada (2014) that there is no agreement as to whether multicultural education has the connotation of education about cultural diversity, or education to form attitudes to respect cultural diversity. Sunarto, K. (2004. p. 47) explains that multicultural education is education for cultural diversity in society, and is sometimes interpreted as education that offers various models of cultural diversity in society, and is defined as education to foster student attitudes to appreciate diversity. culture. Meanwhile, multicultural education in Indonesia, as explained by H.A.R Tilaar (2004, p., 137) that Multicultural Education is to increase appreciation of the ethnic and cultural diversity of the community.

Based on this understanding, whatever the definition given by education experts is the fact that the Indonesian nation consists of many tribes, cultures, religions, races, and languages. In line with multicultural education so that it can be implemented, Indonesia wants a safe, peaceful country without any discriminatory treatment in an environment that has diversity (Zubaedi 2012).

Therefore, it is important to compare multicultural education in each country because basically each has different characteristics. However, in writing this article, we only analyze and compare multicultural education in the United States and Indonesia, because as we know that America is the forerunner of the birth of Multicultural Education which has an impact on every country. For this reason, the author is interested in analyzing and comparing both in terms of history, policy, and implementation of Multicultural Education in the two countries, namely in America and Indonesia. The findings are then expected to add insight to readers and can be used as a reference for other writers in studying Multicultural Education in general, as well as Multicultural Education in particular in America or in Indonesia.

Methods

The method used in this study is a literature review (literature review) with a descriptive qualitative approach. Qualitative research according to Creswell, J.W. (2013, p. 4) and Hamzah, A. (2019, p.25) is a technique for collecting data from social or humanitarian issues, then investigated in a complete, comprehensive and holistic manner. Qualitative-descriptive approach is data that has been obtained from several sources and then described thoroughly. The data collection techniques used in this study were sourced from databases such as Google Scholar, ScienDirect and Taylor & Francis Online as well as other academic online media relevant to the research topic. While the data analysis technique used is in the form of content analysis, which is a text analysis method used to collect information that can be communicated (Hamzah, A. 2019, p. 99).

Results and Discussion

In this section, the author will present the results and discussion based on the articles obtained by the author. These findings use the library research method,

especially regarding the comparative analysis of Multicultural Education in America and Indonesia in terms of history and policy. The following are the results of the article findings and further discussion presented in the form of a table below, as follows:

Table 1. Description of Article Findings on the History of Multicultural Education in America

No.	Researcher Name	Findings
1	Yanuarti et al., (2020)	The existence of the civil rights movement in the 1960s was the result of discriminatory social life practices between white and colored (black) groups.
2	Masunah, (2011)	According to Banks, from a historical point of view, Multicultural Education in the United States is related to the social and political movements of the 1960s on human rights.
3	Rosyada, (2014)	In the 1960s, there were still some people who felt that their civil rights had not been fulfilled.
4	Banks, (2015)	Multicultural education was first developed in America in response to the African-American civic movement in the late 1990s and 1970s.

The data found in the articles in table 1 show that the history of Multicultural Education in America emerged in the 1960s because of the reform movement that discussed the issue of discrimination between whites and blacks. Multicultural education was first developed in America in response to the African-American civic movement in the late 1990s and 1970s. African Americans demand that schools and colleges include content about their history and culture in African American curricula, teaching professions, and administrative activities. This is because, since the 1950s, there has been a discriminatory practice that only recognizes the culture of the white majority. While other groups are grouped as

minorities whose rights are limited (Yanuarti et al., 2020). Meanwhile, according to Zamroni (2011, p., 141) that especially in the United States, because of the dominant Anglo Saxon White Male Protestant culture (WMPA).

As revealed by Amirin, (2013) that the multicultural education movement in the United States which later became global was based on racial, ethnicity, gender, and cultural discrimination by the (ethnic) group and the "majority" culture of the White Male Protestant Anglo-Saxon (WMPA), and therefore seeks to ensure that all Americans , without exception getting the same right to education. Therefore, according to Banks, viewed from the perspective of the history of Multicultural Education in the United States, which is related to social and political action on human rights. However, in the 1960s it did not guarantee full rights to minority groups, but some people still felt that their civil rights had not been fulfilled.

Table 2. Description of Article Findings on the History of Multicultural Education in Indonesia

No.	Researcher Name	Findings
1	Yanuarti et al., (2020)	After the collapse of the New Order, the democratic framework opened up about the ideas of pluralism and multiculturalism as a result of the politics of uniformity and monoculturalism, and in the end it has been planned since the fall of the Suharto regime during the authoritarian national system in 1998 in Indonesia.
2	Zubaedi (2012)	Multicultural education finds its momentum when the authoritarian-military national system collapses along with the fall Suharto regime
3	Nurcahyono, (2018)	Through a diachronic approach, the development of multicultural education in Indonesia is divided into 3 phases, namely: 1) segregation education in the colonial and pre-colonial periods, 2) education with a melting pot capital, 3) current multicultural education in the form of

educational philosophy, educational approach and field
of educational studies..

The data in table 2 relates to the history of Multicultural Education in Indonesia
when compared to the history of Multicultural Education in the United States. The
discourse of multiculturalism in Indonesia is still relatively young compared to
the United States. Indonesia itself, related to pluralism and multiculturalism, has
emerged since the collapse of the New Order (Orba) period led by President
Soeharto due to its uniform policy and monoculturalism. So that at that time,
Multicultural Education got its momentum when the authoritarian-militaristic
national system fell along with the fall of the regime.

However, when viewed using a diagnostic approach as the findings in the table
above, there are three phases of the journey of Multicultural Education in
Indonesia, namely first, segregation education during the colonial and pre-colonial
times, second, education with melting pot capital, and third, current multicultural
education. in the form of educational philosophy, educational approach and field
of educational studies. Based on this, although the peak of the emergence of
Multicultural Education in Indonesia was marked by the fall of the New Order
regime, in fact, since the pre-colonial and colonial times there had been
discrimination against the people of the Archipelago (Indonesia) at that time.

Table 3. Description of the Findings of the Articles of Multicultural Education
Policy in America

No.	Researcher Name	Findings
1	Daheri, M. (2021)	Multicultural Education Policy in the United States as part of the social assimilation of immigrants in the mainstream social.
2	Wulandari, T. (2008)	Education policies taken by the United States government, people feel they have a very strong right to determine what kind of education system is most appropriate for their society.

| 3 | Yurtseven, N. (2013) | Through a diachronic approach, the Education policies should be restructured and state-specific practices should have a common framework for eliminating inequalities of opportunity. |

From the third table above, the findings about Multicultural Education policy in the United States are as part of social assimilation for immigrants in the mainstream social. Education policies taken by the United States government are based on awareness of the rights of the American people, where people feel very strong to determine the education system that will be run by the government for them. According to Rebell, M. A. & Wolff, J. R. (2012) that the goal of education policy in the United States is to improve academic standards and eliminate achievement gaps between students. The aim of the policy is to provide equal opportunities and eliminate inequalities in society.

Therefore, according to Yurtseven, N. (2013), it is very important that American policies have a general framework to eliminate injustice in education. Within that framework, policies in the United States are still making maximum efforts to generalize the distribution of resources equally and provide a comprehensive way to offer non-discriminatory educational services.

Table 4. Description of the Findings of the Articles of Multicultural Education Policy in Indonesia

No.	Researcher Name	Findings
1	Hanafy M. S. (2015)	Culture, as a nation's wealth, can no longer be regulated by central policies, but rather developed in the context of each local culture.
2	Najmina, (2018)	The government system that did not pay attention to human development in the previous era, the policy of the State of Indonesia was dominated by economic interests and national stability

| 3 | Imelda Wahyuni, (2015) | The language and culture of the Indonesian people were born from their ancestors which were preserved and preserved based on local policies. |

Based on the data in table 4 above, it was found that policies related to multicultural education in Indonesia were dominated by economic interests and national stability in the previous era, which did not pay attention to human development. Thus, currently related to the culture that characterizes each region, it is no longer regulated or there is cultural uniformity regulated in national policies, but rather developed in the context of each local culture. This is also based on the regional autonomy policy which provides space for each region to develop and advance its culture. Language and culture is one example of ancestral heritage in Indonesia, which as a result of internalization born of predecessors is preserved based on local policies.

Therefore, when compared to the Multicultural Education policies of the two countries, it can be concluded that the policy in America on Multicultural Education is as social assimilation for immigrants, while in Indonesia it is a form of cultural development of each region.

Discussion and Recommendations

A comparison of multicultural education in America and Indonesia based on the results of the review shows that from a historical point of view, Multicultural Education in America emerged in the 1960s because of the reform movement that addressed the issue of discrimination between white and black groups, while in Indonesia it was marked after the collapse of the New Order era in 1998 which opened the shell of democracy regarding the understanding of pluralism and multiculturalism due to the politics of uniformity and monoculturalism. Meanwhile, in terms of Multicultural Education policy, in America it is part of social assimilation for immigrants, while in Indonesia it is the development of the local cultural context in each region.

References

Amirin, T. M. (2013). implementasi Pendekatan Pendidikan Multikultural Kontekstual Berbasis Kearifan Lokal di Indonesia. *Jurnal Pembangunan Pendidikan: Fondasi Dan Aplikasi*, *1*(1). https://doi.org/10.21831/jppfa.v1i1.1047.

Banks, J. A. (2015). Multicultural Education. In *International Encyclopedia of Social & Behavioral Sciences* (Second Edition, Vol. 16). Elsevier. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-097086-8.92097-X

Bhikhu Parekh, Rethinking Multiculturalism: Keberagaman Budaya Dan Teori Politik (Yogyakarta: Penerbit Kansiius, 2008)

Chester, W. (2008). U.S. copyright law (title 17 of U.S. code) governs the reproduction and redistribution of copyrighted material. *The Policy-Based Profession: An Introduction to Social Welfare Policy Analysis for Social Workers.*

Creswell, J.W. (2013). Research Design Pendekatan Kualitatif, Kuantitatif, dan Mixed. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.

Daheri, M. (2021). Pendidikan Multikultural di Amerika: Tinjauan Sejarah dan Kebijakan. *Jurnal Pendidikan" EDUKASIA MULTIKULTURA"*, *3*(1), 8-14.

Dewantara, K. H. (1961). Karya Ki Hajar Dewantara bab I: Pendidikan. Jakarta: Majelis Luhur Taman Siswa.

Driyarkara, Tentang Pendidikan, Jakarta: Kanisius 1980.

Hamzah, A. (2019). Metode Penelitian Kepustakaan (Library Research: Kajian filosofis, Teoritis dan aplikatif). Malang: Literasi Nusantara.

Imelda Wahyuni. (2015). Pendidikan Multikultural: Upaya Memaknai Keragaman Bahasa Di Indonesia. *Jurnal Pemikiran Islam*, *1*(1), 79–96.

Masunah, J. (2011). KONSEP DAN PRAKTIK PENDIDIKAN MULTIKULTURAL.pdf. *Ilmu Pendidikan*, *17*(4), 298–306. http://journal.um.ac.id/index.php/jip/article/view/2732.

Najmina, N. (2018). Pendidikan Multikultural Dalam Membentuk Karakter Bangsa Indonesia. *Jupiis: Jurnal Pendidikan Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial*, *10*(1), 52. https://doi.org/10.24114/jupiis.v10i1.8389.

Nurcahyono, O. H. (2018). Pendidikan Multikultural Di Indonesia: Analisis Sinkronis Dan Diakronis. *Habitus: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosiologi, & Antropologi*, *2*(1), 105. https://doi.org/10.20961/habitus.v2i1.20404.

Palili, S. (2018). Perkembangan Masyarakat dalam Dimensi Pendidikan Berbasis Multikultural. Tarbiyatuna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam, 11(2), 199-227.

Rebell, M. A. & Wolff, J. R. (2012). Educational opportunity is achievable and affordable. Phi Delta Kappan, 93(6), 62-65.

Rosyada, D. (2014). Pendidikan Multikultural Di Indonesia Sebuah Pandangan Konsepsional. *SOSIO DIDAKTIKA: Social Science Education Journal*, *1*(1). https://doi.org/10.15408/sd.v1i1.1200.

Sunarto, K. (2004). Multicultural Education in Schools, Challenges in its Implementation. dalam Jurnal Multicultural Education in Indonesia and South East Asia, Edisi I.

Tilaar, H. A. R., & Hapsari, S. D. (2004). Multikulturalisme: Tantangan-tantangan global masa depan dalam transformasi pendidikan nasional. Gramedia Widiasarana Indonesia (Grasindo).Wulandari, T. (2008). Kebijakan Pendidikan di Amerika Serikat. Istoria: *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Sejarah,* 7(1).

Yanuarti, E., & HS, D. P. S. (2020). Analisis Perbandingan Pendidikan Multikultural (Indonesia, Amerika, Kanada, Inggris). At-Ta'lim: Media Informasi Pendidikan Islam, 19(1), 46-65.

Zamroni. (2011). Pendidikan demokrasi pada masyarakat multikultural. Gavin Kalam Utama.

Zubaedi. (2012). *Pendidikan Berbasis Masyarakat: Upaya Menawarkan Solusi terhadap Berbagai Problem Sosial*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Belajar.